

Procedure for Each Entry

1. Briefly make periodic announcements: turn off cell phones, no photos, etc.
2. Introduce yourselves and say “hello.”
3. *Ask for and read the process paper and annotated bibliography.*
4. *Ask the students to begin (documentary, performance) or begin viewing the exhibit.*
5. Keep the time.
6. Conduct the interview.
7. Thank the student(s).
8. Take notes as you go... in pencil.
9. Stay on schedule!

Paper and Website Judges – Please skip steps 3 and 4.

Interviews: Best Practices

| Thought | Thoughtful Verbal Comment/ Question |
|--|---|
| This work is outstanding. | If you say “Great job,” say it to every student. |
| This is my favorite topic/ I love this topic. | “How did you choose your topic?” |
| This project looks professionally made. I wonder if these kids had help. | “How did you create your project?” |
| How could this student possibly have read ALL of these sources? | “Please describe your research process. When did you begin gathering and reading your source material?” |
| This project needs so much work. | “How is your project significant in history?” |

Disqualification vs. Infraction

| | Minor Infraction | Major Infraction | Disqualification |
|------------|---|---|--|
| Definition | A violation that does not provide a competitive advantage | Exceeding any of the equalizers(time, size, words), thus creating a competitive advantage by being able to provide more information | The ONLY grounds for this are: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. reusing an entry from a previous year; 2. plagiarism; 3. tampering with another entry. |
| Example | School name on process paper, exceeding word count by 10 words, etc. | Exceeding words by 10+, size by 1 inch+, time by more than 5-10 seconds. | |
| Procedure | Note these in your comments. These violations should not prevent an entry from advancing. Consider them only to break a tie between two entries that are otherwise equal. | Note these in your comments. These entries should NOT advance. If they truly are the best, please consult with NHD staff. | Please do not act on your own. Bring this concern immediately to NHD staff, who will decide if the entry should be removed from competition. |

Evaluation Forms: Best Practices

| Thought | Constructive Comment |
|--|---|
| This project needs a lot of work. | You're off to a good start. Consider strengthening your project by... |
| Performance is just not your thing but your research is strong. | Your courage at creating a performance is admirable, but another category might enable you to demonstrate your research better. |
| The documentary sound quality was awful. | The poor audio quality of your documentary distracted from the overall project. Consider testing your audio on different systems and in different settings. |
| Your annotations don't tell me whether you've even read these sources! | Be careful to use your annotations to explain how you used your sources. |
| Your project does not relate to the theme. | Consider making a stronger case in your process paper for your project's relationship to the theme. |
| I don't agree with your interpretation. | Reading ___ would have strengthened your entry by providing additional information on which to base your interpretation. <i>OR</i> Historians disagree on interpretation of this topic. Your case would be strengthened by finding additional evidence for ___. |



PERFORMANCE

1

| JUDGING CRITERIA (Judging criteria are explained in the <i>Rule Book</i>) | EVALUATION | | | |
|--|------------|-----------|------|----------------------|
| | SUPERIOR | EXCELLENT | GOOD | NEEDS IMPROVEMENT |

| Historical Quality (60%) | SUPERIOR | EXCELLENT | GOOD | NEEDS IMPROVEMENT |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| • Entry is historically accurate | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Shows analysis and interpretation | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Places topic in historical context | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Shows wide research | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Uses available primary sources | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Research is balanced | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

| Relation to Theme (20%) | SUPERIOR | EXCELLENT | GOOD | NEEDS IMPROVEMENT |
|---|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| • Clearly relates topic to theme | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Demonstrates significance of topic in history and draws conclusions | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

| Clarity of Presentation (20%) | SUPERIOR | EXCELLENT | GOOD | NEEDS IMPROVEMENT |
|--|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| • Presentation, written material is original, clear, appropriate, organized and articulate | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Performers show good stage presence; props and costumes are historically accurate | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

| Rules Compliance | Yes | No |
|---|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| • Maintains time requirement (10 minutes) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Includes annotated bibliography | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • All equipment student-run | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Other | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

COMMENTS

- Strengths
- Areas for Improvement

Fantastic performance. Best one today.

Good job. :)

Awesome props!

Love your topic!

This performance deserves a top award.

Problems:

❖ These comments tell the student nothing about what he did well or how he might improve. They are just flattery.

❖ Please don't provide actual rankings or tell students they deserve an award. Even if an entry places first in the first-round, it may come in lower in the finals. These comments will be very confusing and potentially harmful!

❖ The judge clearly thinks this entry is superior. But why? What is so well done? And, is it flawless? There's always room for growth.

❖ This empty space could be filled with comments.



EXHIBIT

Unacceptable Evaluation Form Example

| JUDGING CRITERIA <small>(Judging criteria are explained in the Rule Book)</small> | EVALUATION | | | | |
|--|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| | SUPERIOR | EXCELLENT | GOOD | NEEDS IMPROVEMENT | |
| Historical Quality (60%) | | | | | |
| • Entry is historically accurate | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Shows analysis and interpretation | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Places topic in historical context | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Shows wide research | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Uses available primary sources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Research is balanced | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Relation to Theme (20%) | | | | | |
| • Clearly relates topic to theme | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Demonstrates significance of topic in history and draws conclusions | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Clarity of Presentation (20%) | | | | | |
| • Exhibit, written material is original, clear, appropriate and organized | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| • Exhibit is organized, has visual impact, correctly uses maps, photos, etc. | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Rules Compliance | Yes | No | | | |
| • Maintains size requirement (40" x 30" x 72") | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | | | |
| • Media device maintains time limit (3 minutes) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | | | |
| • Maintains word limit (500 words) | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | | | |
| • Includes annotated bibliography | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | | | |
| • Other | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | | | |

COMMENTS

• Strengths • Areas for Improvement

Your labels are crooked.

You've misspelled so many words on this exhibit.

This has to be more than 500 words and it looks too big as well.

Too many "Triangle Shirtwaist Fire" exhibits. Judges have a hard time telling them apart. Pick a better topic.

Next time go to the library and stop using the Internet.

You relied too much on two sources.

Ask your teacher for more help.

More comments are needed here.

Problems:

❖ Each of these comments is negative but could be rephrased in the positive.

❖ If you suspect a rules violation, please verify. Don't guess!

❖ You may have seen this topic a dozen times, but it's new to this student and he/she deserves your objective feedback.

❖ Some students live far from a library and many quality websites contain reliable material.

❖ The checkboxes indicate this entry ranks somewhere in the middle of those in the judge's group, but the comments say NOTHING about what the student did well. What was so "excellent?" The student may conclude that the judge rated the whole project poorly because it wasn't "pretty" and the topic was not favored.



DOCUMENTARY

Better Example #1

| JUDGING CRITERIA <small>(Judging criteria are explained in the <i>Rule Book</i>)</small> | EVALUATION | | | |
|---|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| | SUPERIOR | EXCELLENT | GOOD | NEEDS IMPROVEMENT |
| Historical Quality (60%) | | | | |
| • Entry is historically accurate | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Shows analysis and interpretation | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Places topic in historical context | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Shows wide research | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Uses available primary sources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Research is balanced | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Relation to Theme (20%) | | | | |
| • Clearly relates topic to theme | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Demonstrates significance of topic in history and draws conclusions | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Clarity of Presentation (20%) | | | | |
| • Presentation, written material is original, clear, appropriate, organized and articulate | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Entry is organized, visual impact is appropriate to topic | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Rules Compliance | Yes | No | | |
| • Maintains time requirement (10 minutes) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | | |
| • Includes annotated bibliography | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | | |
| • All equipment student-run | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | | |
| • Other | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | | |

COMMENTS

- Strengths
- Areas for Improvement

Very nicely assembled documentary that is interesting and a pleasure to view. Your project is supported by a strong research base. Especially impressive are your interviews and primary sources.

Your argument would have been stronger and more persuasive if more context had been included: more background on social attitudes towards women in sports more generally and in American "car culture" as well as greater reference to the profound transformations in those attitudes and in women's rights and status in the 1970s.

Providing this context would strengthen your research base even more as well as improve your argument.

Reasons:

- ❖ The comments are positive and criticisms are phrased constructively.
- ❖ Specific criticisms are backed up with examples.
- ❖ The comments support the checkmarks.

Better still?:

- ❖ More could have been said about why the interviews and sources were so impressive.
- ❖ This judge could have written more, particularly about the topic's relationship to the theme.
- ❖ Another positive comment or two would be appreciated.



EXHIBIT

Better Example #2

| JUDGING CRITERIA <small>(Judging criteria are explained in the <i>Rule Book</i>)</small> | EVALUATION | | | | |
|---|------------|-----------|------|-------------------|--|
| | SUPERIOR | EXCELLENT | GOOD | NEEDS IMPROVEMENT | |

| Historical Quality (60%) | | | | | |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| • Entry is historically accurate | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Shows analysis and interpretation | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Places topic in historical context | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Shows wide research | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Uses available primary sources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Research is balanced | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

| Relation to Theme (20%) | | | | | |
|---|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| • Clearly relates topic to theme | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Demonstrates significance of topic in history and draws conclusions | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

| Clarity of Presentation (20%) | | | | | |
|--|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| • Exhibit, written material is original, clear, appropriate and organized | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Exhibit is organized, has visual impact, correctly uses maps, photos, etc. | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

| Rules Compliance | Yes | No |
|---|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| • Maintains size requirement (40" x 30" x 72") | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Media device maintains time limit (3 minutes) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Maintains word limit (500 words) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Includes annotated bibliography | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • Other | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

COMMENTS

- Strengths
- Areas for Improvement

Interesting topic; very relevant to today in the era of laptops/tablets/cell phones, etc. The exhibit itself is laid out in a clean and clear manner.

Although you have a good thesis statement, be sure to incorporate the theme words "Turning Points" throughout your key points. You have to make the case for the connection to the theme.

Adding some information about what events preceded your topic and how your topic influenced events afterward would have strengthened your exhibit. You've included so much important information but it is unclear how these events came to be or their impact in history.

Work to expand your research into other categories of sources. Try to avoid using only websites in your secondary research. The New York Times is great, but work to branch out more. Reading more and varied secondary material also would help you to determine the historical context of your entry.

Enlist the help of a Language Arts teacher for a thorough proofreading of your process paper and exhibit text.

Your annotations are helpful in demonstrating how a source helped you understand your topic.

Thank you for participating in NHD.

Reasons:

- ❖ The comments are positive and criticisms are phrased constructively.
- ❖ Specific criticisms are backed up with examples. This reads like an action plan for improvement.
- ❖ The comments support the checkmarks.
- ❖ The comments end on a positive note and thanking the student for participating is kind and thoughtful.